What Clinical and Acoustic Clues Can Tell Us About The Causes Of Deteriorating Physical and Mental Health

Acoustical Society of America Conference Presentation 21 May 2015
Pittsburgh, USA
A Diagnostic Conundrum

- Some residents living near sources of industrial infrasound and low frequency noise (ILFN) in quiet rural areas report **worsening** existing physical and mental health, and a wide variety of **new** symptoms with **variable** time of onset after ILFN exposure starts.

- Many experience **new** repeated sleep disturbance – including “**waking up suddenly at night in an anxious, frightened, panicked state**”

- Some report **new** sudden “**pressure bolt**” symptoms

Clinical question - **What is causing these symptoms?**
What Causes Annoyance Symptoms?

**Question** - Are the symptoms caused by “suggestion”, (the “nocebo effect”) or are the symptoms caused by the sound energy itself?

*A nocebo effect is an ill effect caused by the suggestion or belief something is harmful.*

**Answer** – Psychoacoustic research, community reaction and attitudinal studies over the last forty years have shown that excessive noise can harm health.

Animal research evidence, careful clinical histories, and human physiological studies from the last thirty years, all provide evidence of *direct physiological effects and tissue pathology*, from sound and vibration energy, *including infrasound.*
What We Already Know

• Low frequency noise from any source can cause a range of symptoms described by engineers as “noise annoyance”

• UK Acoustician Professor Geoff Leventhall in June 2011 at NHMRC Workshop: “noise annoyance symptoms are the same as wind turbine syndrome symptoms” and are “the stress effects from audible noise”
What We Already Know

1982 - 7 – Kelley, et al and Hubbard (NASA)

• **Impulsive infrasound & low frequency noise** from a variety of sources **directly caused annoyance symptoms** in field and laboratory studies

• The dose of sound energy may be **amplified** inside homes by the resonance effects on the building structure

• **Small rooms** facing the sound source the “**worst**”

• Impacts worse with ongoing exposure – “**sensitisation**”

• Sources of ILFN include gas turbines, wind turbines, and military aircraft
What We Already Know

• “Annoyance” symptoms can be caused by excess sound energy, and include *sleep disturbance* and *physiological stress* responses, as well as psychological stress effects

• *Chronic sleep deprivation* and *chronic stress* are both well known to cause serious adverse consequences for physical and mental health

• *Sudden acute physiological stress* can also cause serious problems eg adrenaline surge pathology can cause cardiomyopathy / “heart attacks” and dangerously high blood pressure
New Evidence – Direct Physiological Impact in Brain

• 2014 - 5 – Inagaki et al, Japan
Small study of 15 Japanese wind turbine workers
Exposed to reproduced wind turbine noise from 600 kW wind turbine in a laboratory study
EEG studies showed changes consistent with brains being “unable to achieve a relaxed state”

In other words, the sound energy induced a physiologically stressed state directly in the brain, visualised on objective EEG studies
What Are The Consequences Of Inagaki et al’s Study?

• The “annoyance” symptoms of physiological stress are *directly caused by* the impacts of (wind turbine) sound energy on the brain.

• The “nocebo effect” hypothesis *does not explain the annoyance symptoms* reported by workers, residents, and wind turbine hosts.

• In other words, the *nocebo hypothesis is “dead and buried” as an explanation for the annoyance symptoms reported by residents*. 
Who Predicted The Inagaki EEG Results Showing Physiological Stress?

• 2003/4 – Tharpaland Buddhist Monks, UK – *could not attain a meditative state near operating wind turbines*, report of a field investigation with experienced monks in Scotland

• February 2011 – Waubra Foundation called for EEG / sleep studies in homes of impacted residents, based on clinical histories of severe sleep disturbance and “*waking up suddenly in an anxious frightened panicked state*”
Who Predicted The Inagaki EEG Results Showing Physiological Stress?

- **November 2011** – Steven Cooper, after visit to Capital Wind Development. In an email to a psychologist who conducts EEG’s, he stated the following:
  
  “I have hypothesised that what the residents are receiving is low frequency noise that is affecting their brain functions and in turn their sleep patterns and their health”

- **December 2011** – Rob Rand and Steve Ambrose were the first to specifically hypothesise this effect publicly in their report of the Bruce McPherson Acoustic survey, Falmouth USA (pp 32-33)
What Clues About Physiological Stress Do We Have From Animal Studies?

- Salt’s recent work on guinea pig cochlea – *infrasound stimulation of afferent nerves from the outer hair cells to the brain resulted in an “alerting response”* (the fight flight response) which Salt suggested could explain the repeated sleep disturbances experienced by rural residents, especially in a quiet background noise environment.
What Clues About Physiological Stress Do We Have From Animal Studies?

- **Nishimura 1988** – infrasound (16 Hz, 120 dB) stimulation "appears to induce sympathetic – dominant responses early in the exposure period, due to stimulation of the sympathetic nervous system by the hypophysis* directly, or indirectly via the adrenal glands”

  * Hypophysis = Pituitary gland

Therefore rare clinical reports of conditions resulting from acute adrenaline surges with no usual cause are highly relevant - *transient ILFN pulse pressure peaks could explain these acute episodes*
Which Adrenaline Surge Pathologies are being Reported?

- **Acute Hypertensive Crisis** – can be caused by adrenal tumour called “phaeochromocytoma” and commonly presents with either incidental markedly elevated blood pressure or classic symptoms of an acute crisis.

- **Tako Tsubo Cardiomyopathy** – usually caused by a sudden severe emotional shock. Sometimes named Tako Tsubo “Heart Attacks” – the clinical presentation with chest pain can be very similar to that of blocked coronary arteries.
Clues From Clinical Cases

Case 1 – Farmer from Waubra with Acute Hypertensive Crisis whilst working outdoors

• Overcast day, turbines operating, working approx 1km from nearest turbine cluster (128 in total)
• Sudden onset symptoms – severe headache, felt “heart was going to leap out of his chest”, severe nausea, felt very unwell - so went home.
• Checked blood pressure – over 200 systolic (normally 120), BP stayed elevated for days, and farmer felt jittery, nauseous, and anxious
Clues From Clinical Cases cont.

Case 1 continued

**Diagnosis** – Symptoms consistent with Acute Hypertensive Crisis   **BUT** *no underlying adrenal tumour found with subsequent investigations*

**Cause of symptoms** – *unknown*

**Hypothesis** – he was hit by the *convergence of infrasound pulse pressure peaks* from multiple turbines (*convergence from multiple wind turbines was described by Pierpont 2009, Thorne 2010, Rapley, Bakker & Thorne 2011, Bell 2014*)
Convergence of Sound Waves – Heightened Noise Zone (Bakker & Rapley, 2011)
Clues From Clinical Cases cont.

Case 2 – Farmer (light work outside), Waubra

• Overcast day, turbines operating nearby
• Felt unwell, chest pain and nausea (but *not* severe, central crushing chest pain)
• Went home, and when symptoms failed to resolve went to hospital. **Tako Tsubo Cardiomyopathy “heart attack”** diagnosed by cardiologist. No usual precipitant for symptoms (eg intense emotion) was present
Waubra
Clues From Clinical Cases cont.

Case 3 – Widow resting in her home at night

- Sudden onset chest pain – wind turbines operating, location of house - downwind of a line of turbines, operating at the time
- **Tako Tsubo Cardiomyopathy** subsequently diagnosed in hospital by cardiologist
- No usual precipitant cause
- 2 other family members had heart attacks at same location, one fatal
Clues From Clinical Cases cont.

Case Cluster of Tako Tsubo “heart attacks”

• Location – Cumbo Valley, Hunter Valley, New South Wales, (Australia) near multiple open cut coal mines over 5 km away

• Cluster of multiple residents with Tako Tsubo heart attacks over a period of months – usually between 1 – 3 am on cold frosty nights, in residents reporting “noise annoyance” symptoms and perceptions of vibration inside homes

• Cardiologists could not explain the cluster of Tako Tsubo cases occurring overnight from this region
Hunter Valley, NSW
Comment from Cardiologist, Expert in Takotsubo Cardiomyopathy, July 2014

“I have not encountered, nor am I aware, of any literature on low frequency sound as a possible trigger for takotsubo cardiomyopathy. In my opinion, any physiologic stress (including sound) which causes a substantial increase in plasma catecholamines might serve as a trigger for this condition. There are a substantial proportion of patients (perhaps 20%) in whom we cannot identify a specific trigger”

Dr Scott Sharkey, MD, Cardiologist, Minneapolis
Case with Concurrent Infrasound Measurement

Final Case – “Pressure Bolt Sensations”

• Resident at Macarthur – gave evidence in Cherry Tree Court Case about sudden onset of pressure bolt sensations perceived in the back of his head, whilst sitting relaxing in his home

• Mr Les Huson – acoustician – coincidentally collected concurrent infrasound measurements at the same time – to which the resident was “blinded” (ie unaware of pressure pulse peaks subsequently identified in the data)
Mr Les Huson’s expert opinion

“Industrial infrasound levels of 0.5 Pa peak-peak at 12.5 Hz have caused recognised and accepted nuisance complaints. Pressure transients exceeding 5 Pa peak-peak have been observed that correlate with observation of Mr G…… that causes him concern. Other lower amplitude peak-peak pressure transients have also correlated with Mr G……’s diary logs with an overall correlation of 86% “
Future Research Priorities:

1. **Physiological data** (EEG, heart rate, non invasive blood pressure studies and biomarkers) with **concurrent full spectrum acoustic measurements inside homes** to
   - *confirm direct causation* of physiological stress,
   - *establish triggers* (frequencies & threshold) for **acute sleep disturbance episodes**, and
   - *validate infrasound sensation perception thresholds* established by Kelley (1985) and Cooper (2014) of 50 dB 4-5 Hz narrow band for chronically sensitised residents - 6 years exposure at Cape Bridgewater
The Next Steps – Infrasound Dosimeters & Physiological Data

Future Research Priorities

2. Infrasound Dosimeters – wind turbines

• occupational exposures (farmers, wind turbine workers, acousticians)

• measure exposures during acute adrenaline surge events

• measure individual exposures for severely impacted people
The Next Steps – Infrasound Dosimeters & Physiological Data

Future Research Priorities cont.

3. Infrasound Dosimeters – other applications

A wide range of other ILFN sources – mines, gas and coal fired power stations, aircraft, trains, passenger ferries and other shipping with large diesel engines where ILFN related pathology is also being reported (i.e. symptoms of noise annoyance/WTS or ”ILFN Syndrome”, and vibroacoustic disease)
Contact Details

Email: sarah@waubrafoundation.org.au

Phone: 61 474 050 463

Website: www.waubrafoundation.org.au
Biographical Details

Author: Sarah Laurie, CEO Waubra Foundation
Bachelor Medicine, Bachelor Surgery, Flinders University, 1995
Former Rural General Practitioner
Former Fellow and Clinical Examiner for Royal Australian College of General Practitioners
Former Fellow Australian College Rural and Remote Medicine
Former Member State Council, South Australian branch Australian Medical Association
References

Stepanov, K “Health Risk Factors of Low Frequency Noise Oscillation below 20 Hz”

National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences, USA 2001 “Infrasound, Brief Review of Toxicological Literature”
References

Alves Pereira N, Castelo Branco N 2006 “Vibroacoustic disease: Biological effects of infrasound and low-frequency noise explained by mechanotransduction cellular signalling”

Alves Pereira M, Castelo Branco N “Vibroacoustic disease: the need for a new attitude towards noise”
Professor Geoff Leventhall’s comments to the NHMRC Workshop in June 2011 that “noise annoyance” symptoms are the same as “wind turbine syndrome” symptoms, and are a stress effect (from audible noise):

References

Hubbard, H “Noise Induced House Vibrations and Human Perception” 1982

Kelley N et al “A Methodology for Assessment of Wind Turbine Noise Generation” 1982
References


Kelley, N “Problem with Low Frequency Noise from Wind Turbines Scientifically Identified” 1987 Presented to the American Wind Energy Association Conference, 1987, California
References

Effects of chronic sleep deprivation – see WHO Night Noise Guidelines for Europe 2009

Capuccio et al “Sleep duration predicts cardiovascular outcomes: a systematic review and meta-analysis of prospective studies” European Heart Journal Feb 2011
References


Vitiliano, P et al “A Path Model of Chronic Stress, the Metabolic Syndrome, and Coronary Heart Disease” 2002 Psychosomatic Medicine 64: 414-435


References

Waubra Foundation Submission to First Australian Federal Senate inquiry into Rural Wind Farms Feb 2011

Ambrose, S & Rand R “Bruce McPherson Infrasound and Low Frequency Noise Study” December 2011 (pp 32 – 33)
References


Nishimura, K “Effects of Infrasound on Pituitary Adrenocortical Response & Gastric Microcirculation in Rats” Journal of Low Frequency Sound and Vibration Vol 7 no 1 1988 (20 – 33)
References

Sharkey, S et al “Takotsubo (Stress) Cardiomyopathy” Circulation – Cardiology patient page
http://circ.ahajournals.org/content/124/18/e460.full#sec-5

http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3414427/
References


“Coming from several towers at once, these low frequency air pressure fluctuations may synchronize and reinforce, depending on the orientation of the towers and house and the timing of the individual turbines”


Thorne R, “The Dean Report” 2010

References


Bell, A Technical Note “*Constructive Interference of Tonal Infrasound from Synchronised Wind Farm Turbines: Evidence and Implications*” Acoustics Australia Vol 42 No 2 Dec 2014

References

Gardner, Andrew  Statement of Evidence for Cherry Tree case, 2013 re pressure bolt sensations experienced at home at Macarthur Wind Development, Victoria

Huson, L  Expert Opinion for Cherry Tree case, 2013
References

Cooper, S “The Results of An Acoustic Testing Program at Cape Bridgewater Wind Farm”, December 2014 for Pacific Hydro

See also the Waubra Foundation summary of the Cooper study and its implications